

Nurses' Turnover Intentions in Private Hospitals: A Narrative Study

Intenciones de Rotación de Enfermeros en Hospitales Privados: Un Estudio Narrativo

Monika Steffi Novia Sabatini^{1a}, Luky Dwiantoro^b, Nur Setiawati Dewi^{3c}

SUMMARY

Objective: This study aims to analyze the problems often faced by nurses with a holistic approach to identifying the main motivations or reasons why nursing staff intends to move from the hospital where they work.

Methods: This research was conducted by using a qualitative method with a narrative study approach using semi-structured interviews where one participant will be given guideline questions and 8 responsive assessments that will be given to respondents where the assessment has previously gone through the expert test stage.

Results: Organizational policies (job design and compensation), leadership style, and work environment

significantly influenced the level of nurses' turnover intentions in hospitals.

Conclusion: Hospital management should provide excellent service to employees, especially nurses in terms of work appreciation in the form of compensation (reward), preparing competent leaders, and creating a comfortable and safe work environment so that nurses feel at home in carrying out their duties at the hospital.

Keywords: Turnover intention, nurse, hospital.

RESUMEN

Objetivo: Este estudio tiene como objetivo analizar los problemas que a menudo enfrentan las enfermeras con un enfoque holístico para identificar las principales motivaciones o razones por las cuales el personal de enfermería tiene la intención de trasladarse del hospital donde trabaja. **Métodos:** Esta investigación se llevó a cabo utilizando un método cualitativo con un enfoque de estudio narrativo utilizando entrevistas semiestructuradas en las que a un participante se le darán preguntas guía y 8 evaluaciones receptivas que se le darán a los encuestados donde la evaluación ha pasado previamente por la etapa de prueba de expertos.

Resultados: Las políticas organizacionales (diseño de puestos y compensación), el estilo de liderazgo y el ambiente de trabajo influyeron significativamente en el nivel de intenciones de rotación de las enfermeras en los hospitales.

Conclusión: La gerencia del hospital debe brindar un excelente servicio a los empleados, especialmente a las enfermeras en términos de apreciación del trabajo en la forma de compensación (recompensa), preparar líderes competentes y crear un ambiente de trabajo

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.47307/GMC.2023.131.s1.14>

ORCID: 0000-0002-6988-7354¹

ORCID: 0000-0001-6425-5801³

Department of Nursing, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas
Diponegoro, Semarang, Indonesia^{1,2,3}

*Corresponding author: Monika Steffi Novia Sabatini

E-mail: monika.steffi89@gmail.com

Department of Nursing, Faculty of Medicine, Universitas
Diponegoro, Semarang, Indonesia.

Phone: +62 855-4050-5032

Recibido: 5 de febrero 2023

Aceptado: 11 de febrero 2023

cómodo y seguro para que las enfermeras se sientan como en casa en el desempeño de sus funciones en el hospital.

Palabras clave: *Intención de rotación, enfermera, hospital.*

INTRODUCTION

As an institution engaged in health services, hospitals are established by the private sector and the government (1), to provide services for the wider community. Hospitals carry out complete activities by providing services including preventive, promotive, curative, and rehabilitative as well as providing services in inpatient, outpatient, and emergency services (2). Human resources including nurses are valuable assets in a company or organization such as a hospital. Nurses are the largest human resource in hospitals and have an important role in maintaining and improving the quality of health services in hospitals (3).

The problem that is often faced by hospital management is the turnover intention or nurses who decide to leave work (1). The problem of turnover intention in nurses must be considered because it can affect the performance of a hospital in terms of optimal service (4), one of the factors that influence the occurrence of turnover intention in hospitals and moving to another hospital is an under pressure workload. The workload consists of internal and external factors. Internal factors include gender, age, and health conditions; while external factors include tasks, work environment, and work organization (4).

The intention to move to another hospital is always the driving force behind a nurse's decision to leave the hospital where she works. Working conditions that are not in line with expectations, the absence of good rewards or awards from hospitals for nurses, poor compensation, and workloads that exceed the ability of nurses are all factors that cause nurses to consider changing jobs (5). Leadership style influences nurse job satisfaction, so if the leader has a good and competent leadership style, job satisfaction will increase, preventing the desire to change jobs (6).

Hospital X, located in the city of Solo Baru, is a private hospital that has been fully accredited

and provides various kinds of health services that can be accessed by the surrounding community. The problem faced by hospitals, especially management, is the large number of nurses who resign from the hospital and move to another hospital. In 2018 there were 12.7 % of nurses left and in 2019 as many as 12.4 % of nurses left. Thus, this study aimed to evaluate the problems faced by nurses by exploring the factors that are the main reasons nurses have the desire to leave the hospital.

METHODS

The study was conducted by using a qualitative research method with a narrative study approach using semi-structured interviews using one female participant, age 26 years old, with nurse education, working period at hospital X for 3 years to reveal the participants' personal experiences while working in the hospital. The research process at Hospital X in Solo Baru used a mobile phone to record every question and answer about the interview by using guideline questions to guide the course of the research, a total of 8 responsive assessments that previously underwent an expert assessment process or test. This study was approved by *Komisi Etik Penelitian Kesehatan* (Research Ethics Committee), Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Diponegoro Semarang No. 291/EC/KEPK/FK-UNDIP/VIII/2021. Interviews were conducted by previously giving informed consent to participants and lasted for 20 minutes. conducted by

RESULTS

This research was conducted in Indonesia, precisely at Hospital X located in Solo Baru, by interviewing one participant who was a nurse with the initials A so that the researchers found three main topics.

Organizational policy (job design and compensation)

Nurse A worked at X Solo Baru hospital for 3 years, was 26 years old, and was educated as

a Nurse. Nurse A is willing to participate in an interview about turnover intention. A recent graduate who was very happy initially got a job at X Solo Baru Hospital because they were bonafide and trusted. This nurse said that getting a job is a dream after graduating from college to improve self-quality, as she said in the following quote.

“I was very happy when I was accepted to work as a nurse at hospital X in Solo Baru because it was my first time working at a hospital. Because at that time I was a fresh graduate, I needed income. I hope to give my best and try as optimally as possible. The skills and knowledge that I learned during the study are expected to be applied in hospital X, so that the hospital can develop (P1).”

Nurse A revealed that the hospital's policy initially ran normally and there were no visible deviations before it became clear that the hospital had policies that were by the rules, the rules were always changing and always suddenly by current conditions without any prior socialization. This inconsistent policy made nurses at hospital X, including nurse A, feel unwilling to work any longer. The policies made by the management were felt to be troublesome and confusing for nurses.

“The policies and regulations at the beginning of my work at hospital X were running normally because hospital X was a new hospital that was less than 4 years old. Hospital X's policies may still adopt the policies of other hospitals. But in my second year working, there are policies and rules that I think are disturbing, such as Standard Operating Procedures (SOPs) are always changed at any time, even in one month the SOPs can be changed many times. I don't think this is appropriate because the SOP is the nurse's reference in providing nursing care. If the SOP is inconsistent, how will we provide quality nursing services according to procedures? This makes it difficult for staff so that they become confused and afraid to act because the rules and policies are inconsistent and always changing (P2).”

Nurse A is increasingly uncomfortable at work because she is tired of a lot workload. There is no opportunity to rest to make the body relax and fit again. Heavy work with an imbalance between the number of nurses working with patients being treated. Nurse A needed time to take a break from work but there was not enough time for her. The work was done wholeheartedly by nurse A but there was no good feedback from hospital X in providing good compensation. So that the turnover intention is getting higher.

“There is always an intention to make a turnover from the hospital. The policies and rules made by management make me depressed. I feel that work is not flexible, not happy, I feel pressured, and I am required to comply with SOPs. Unfortunately, these SOPs always change in such a short time. We are confused about which reference to follow. If the question about feeling depressed was asked to 20 other nurses who work at hospital X, I'm sure 18 out of 20 nurses, or even all nurses want to get out of the hospital immediately. Hospital management does not provide good compensation for nurses, for example, HRD cuts salaries at will not count and suddenly the salary that is earned a month is cut just like that. Salary cuts are made unilaterally without considering that the nurse is sick. Nurses are sick because they treat too many patients and are not balanced with the number of nurses especially the patients being treated are patients suffering from 'COVID-19'. HRD is not allowed to deduct nurses' salaries due to unexpected illness. HRD should provide good compensation so that nurses can continue to be healthy and work optimally.

It would be better if the human resources were qualified, and already good in terms of education, they should be given the reward they deserve. HRD should not only take advantage of employees who have worked day and night and even overtime, but the rewards given are inappropriate. Patients continue to increase but HR is not added which has an impact on increasing working hours for nurses. Hospital X management also does not provide adequate rest hours, even though

nurses need time to rest so they can get back in shape and work well (P4, P6, P7)."

Leadership Style

In providing nursing care to patients so that they can be of quality, in addition to following procedures in the form of SOPs, nurse A must follow the guidelines of the head of the room who is nurse A's supervisor in the room. The head of the room must have leadership competence so that subordinates, especially implementing nurses, can do things correctly and not harm the hospital. Nurse A assumes that the head of the room who is the boss is incompetent and always provides a work atmosphere that makes nurses feel uncomfortable working.

"Bad experiences at work dominate more than good experiences. An example of a bad experience was in my room where the head of the room was not objective in judging. When there was an error, the head of the room did not find out who made the mistake and why it happened. The head of the room will blame innocent people without giving them a chance to defend themselves (P5, P6)."

The head of the room does not guide and teach the right things to employees. When something goes wrong, the head of the room always blames the employee. The head of the room does not set a good example for employees to follow.

"I'm feeling pressed by the way the room's leader is being treated. Everyday, the head of the room is irritated because of ambiguities. Employees who work like adults do not need to be chastised in the same way that kindergarten children are. Even though the head of the room does not provide adequate guidance, I understand my role as a nurse. In judging the nurses, the ward's head is biased and not objective (P9)."

Work environment

Nurse A stated that a comfortable and safe work environment would make her feel at

home at work. On the other hand, a bad work environment will make employees feel uneasy and finally decide to leave their jobs. Nurse A's work environment is not favorable because she is under pressure and is not regarded as a competent employee, prompting her to consider leaving for another hospital.

"In the new room, even though I've only been on the roll for 3 months, I feel comfortable, safe, and at home. Although the work is heavier than previous room, I feel comfortable in my room, there is no pressure, and the atmosphere is very comfortable. When going to work there is no burden and feeling of laziness, there is only enthusiasm for work because the work atmosphere is very supportive and does not pressure me. The head of the room gives rewards and always mingles with other employees. If there is an error, the head of the room assesses objectively and generalizes his employees, and does not discriminate. This kind of work environment makes me feel at home, safe, and comfortable because the work environment is good and conducive (P.10)."

DISCUSSION

Several elements impact nurses' inclination to transfer from one institution to another. The influencing factors are hospital management paying less attention to nurses by not providing appropriate rewards or compensation, hospital policies deemed inappropriate and uncertain (always changing), a perceived leadership style that does not reflect a good leader, and a work environment that is not conducive.

Employees' desire to shift employment, one of which stems from extrinsic variables such as organizational policies, salary, and career growth. One example of an organizational policy that might influence a nurse's inclination to leave work is job design. The desired job design is a leader who enriches nurses' work by giving independence, trust, and chances for employee self-development, in this instance nurses (7). Nurses who are given a clear job design by their organization will better understand and understand what work their obligation is so

that responsibility for work will eventually lead to job satisfaction because they believe the work, they do is not boring and always receives support from the leadership. Compensation is one of the factors that motivate workers to stay with a company. The concept of compensation is extensively defined, including terms such as prizes, salaries, incentives, allowances, and facilities. Employees utilize the money to satisfy their requirements, therefore if remuneration is provided by the business following employee expectations, the urge to leave work will never arise. Employees are driven to work when they are paid well, which leads to a high level of responsibility, which enhances job satisfaction and eliminates the urge to leave employment (7).

A leader's leadership style may be classified into various categories, including situational, transactional, transformational, servant, and visionary leadership. Leadership is linked to nurse job satisfaction, boosting productivity and work effectiveness, hence increasing nurse retention. Good leadership has a beneficial impact on the work environment, job happiness, organizational commitment, and nursing performance, resulting in nurses not wanting to quit their jobs (8). Nurses who work in hospitals demand good leadership; leaders must exhibit a leadership style that may offer inspiration to work, make nurses feel wanted, and ultimately promote job satisfaction.

One of the elements that contribute to nurses still feeling at home in a hospital is the work environment is supportive. The work environment is an external element that influences how people execute their jobs, therefore influencing an organization's performance. According to research, a poor and uncomfortable work atmosphere causes employees to feel unwelcome in a business, causing them to consider quitting (9). Organizations or hospitals where nurses work must establish a pleasant and conducive ambience or environment, one that is safe and comfortable, so that nurses feel at home and do not consider leaving the institution where they work (10).

CONCLUSION

Nurses' desire to change employment is influenced by numerous factors, including

organizational characteristics, leadership styles, and work environment. Organizations or hospitals where nurses work must provide the best, namely organizational aspects, nurses should be provided the remuneration or rewards needed so that job satisfaction can be achieved, and ultimately the urge to leave work can be avoided. In leadership style, hospitals should develop dependable and dependable leaders who can inspire nurses to perform effectively and efficiently. In the workplace, hospitals should create a safe and comfortable atmosphere for nurses to work in, reducing the nurses' urge to change employment to other hospitals.

Acknowledgments

Our special thanks go to Mac Arif Hamdanas, Ph.D. for his warm and kind encouragement in this project. If the article has any clarity, the credit must go to him who is our most ruthless and loving editor.

Funding

The author(s) received no financial support for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Author's contributions

All contributions contributed significantly to this study and all authors agree with the content of the manuscript.

Conflict of interest

The author(s) declared no potential conflicts of interest with respect to the research authorship, and/or publication of this article.

Ethical clearance

This study was approved by *Komisi Etik Penelitian Kesehatan* (Research Ethics Committee), Faculty of Medicine, Universitas Diponegoro Semarang No. 291/EC/KEPK/FK-UNDIP/VIII/2021.

REFERENCES

1. Mayawati L. The effect of Job Satisfaction and Job Insecurity on The Nurse Turnover Intention. *Ikra-Ith Ph Psychology*. 2021;7(2):56-67.

2. Thalib NY, Ridwanuloh D, Hidayah H. The Influence of Job Satisfaction, Job Stress, and Work Environment on Turnover Intention at IFRS Dewi Sri Karawang. *Cerdika: Indonesian Sci J.* 2021;1(6):696-706.
3. Muslim A, Sutinah S. Professional Career Development for Non-PNS Nurses at X Hospital. *J of Health Management Foundation RS Dr. Soetomo.* 2020;7(7):16-27.
4. Siregar T, Winnarseh W. Correlation of Workload with Potential Nurse Turnover at Ali Sibroh Malisi Hospital, South Jakarta. *J of Persada Husada Indonesia.* 2019;6(2):43-52.
5. Purnama SG. *Vektor. Prodi IKMN FK Universitas Udayana.* Bali: Udayana Press; 2017.
6. Anderson J. The Effect of Leadership and Non-Physical Work Environment on Nurse Job Satisfaction Through Nurse Turnover Intention at Syafira Hospital Pekanbaru. *Online J Students of the Faculty of Economics;* 2016;4(1):816-829.
7. Lusiati A, Supriyanto S. The Impact of Individual, Job and Organizational Factors on Job Satisfaction and Turnover Intentions of Nurses. *J Indonesian Health Administration.* 2013;1(2):156-166.
8. Yasman Y, Sahar J, Nuraini T. The Head of Room Leadership Model according to the View of the Implementing Nurse Related to Retention. *Indonesian Nursing J.* 2015;18(1):31-37.
9. Riani NLT, Putra MS. Effect of Work Stress, Workload and Non-Physical Work Environment on Employee Turnover Intention. *Udayana University Management E-J.* 2017;6(11):5970-5998.
10. Muchlis N, Amir H, Cahyani DD, Alam RI, Landu N, Mikawati M, et al. The cooperative behavior and intention to stay of nursing personnel in healthcare management. *J Med Life.* 2022;15(10):1311-1317.